Res Judicata
Res Judicata

A Handbook on Its Theory, Doctrine, and Practice

Robert C. Casad

John H. and John M. Kane Professor of Law Emeritus
University of Kansas

Kevin M. Clermont

Flanagan Professor of Law
Cornell University

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
SUMMARY OF CONTENT

PART I: THEORY

CHAPTER 1  INTRODUCTION TO RES JUDICATA  3
   A. Significance  3
   B. Sources  5
   C. Contexts  7
   D. Basics  8
   E. Terminology  9

CHAPTER 2  RELATED DOCTRINES  13
   A. Stare Decisis  13
   B. Law of the Case  16
   C. Former Adjudication as Evidence  17
   D. Former Recovery  18
   E. Equitable Estoppel  18
   F. Judicial Estoppel  18
   G. Election of Remedies  19
   H. Other Action Pending  21
   I. Double Jeopardy  22

CHAPTER 3  POLICIES UNDERLYING RULES AND EXCEPTIONS  29
   A. Res Judicata Rules  31
   B. Res Judicata Exceptions  36
   C. Summary  36

CHAPTER 4  JURISPRUDENCE OF RULES AND EXCEPTIONS  39
   A. Res Judicata Rules and Exceptions  40
   B. Claim and Issue Preclusion Doctrine  43
### SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

#### Part II: Doctrine

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5</th>
<th>Prerequisites for Res Judicata</th>
<th>49</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Validity</td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Finality</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6</th>
<th>Claim Preclusion</th>
<th>61</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Requirements of Rule</td>
<td></td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Exceptions to Rule</td>
<td></td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Special Applications: Counterclaims</td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 7</th>
<th>Issue Preclusion</th>
<th>113</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Requirements of Rule</td>
<td></td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Exceptions to Rule</td>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Special Applications: Multiple Determinations</td>
<td></td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 8</th>
<th>Effects on Nonparties</th>
<th>149</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Privies</td>
<td></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Strangers</td>
<td></td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 9</th>
<th>Nonordinary Judgments</th>
<th>189</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Noncoercive Judgments</td>
<td></td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Nonpersonal Judgments</td>
<td></td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Noncivil Judgments</td>
<td></td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Nonjudicial Proceedings</td>
<td></td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 10</th>
<th>Nondomestic Judgments</th>
<th>211</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. General Considerations</td>
<td></td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Judgments of American Courts</td>
<td></td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Judgments of Foreign Nations</td>
<td></td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Part III: Practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 11</th>
<th>Invoking Res Judicata</th>
<th>237</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Raising</td>
<td></td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Proving</td>
<td></td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 12</th>
<th>Defeating Res Judicata</th>
<th>247</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Methods of Attack</td>
<td></td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Grounds for Attack</td>
<td></td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Approaches to Attack’s Methods and Grounds</td>
<td>256</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 13</th>
<th>Jurisdiction to Determine Jurisdiction</th>
<th>263</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Status of This Subdoctrine</td>
<td></td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

B. Content of This Subdoctrine 266
C. Jurisdiction to Determine No Jurisdiction 271
D. A Final View of Validity and Finality 271

Table of Cases 273
Index 277
CONTENTS

Summary of Contents v

PART I: THEORY

CHAPTER 1  INTRODUCTION TO RES JUDICATA  3
  A. Significance  3
  B. Sources  5
  C. Contexts  7
  D. Basics  8
  E. Terminology  9
    1. Claim Preclusion  11
    2. Issue Preclusion  11

CHAPTER 2  RELATED DOCTRINES  13
  A. Stare Decisis  13
  B. Law of the Case  16
  C. Former Adjudication as Evidence  17
  D. Former Recovery  18
  E. Equitable Estoppel  18
  F. Judicial Estoppel  18
  G. Election of Remedies  19
  H. Other Action Pending  21
  I. Double Jeopardy  22
    1. Collateral Estoppel from Criminal Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution of Same Defendant  24
      a. Collateral Estoppel Asserted by Acquitted Defendant  24
      b. Collateral Estoppel Asserted Against Convicted Defendant  25
CONTENTS

2. Collateral Estoppel from Criminal Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution of Different Defendant 26
3. Collateral Estoppel from Civil Judgment to Subsequent Criminal Prosecution 27

Chapter 3 Policies Underlying Rules and Exceptions 29
A. Res Judicata Rules 31
   1. Procedural Factors Favoring Preclusion 31
   2. Procedural Factors Favoring Nonpreclusion 33
   3. Combining All Factors 35
B. Res Judicata Exceptions 36
C. Summary 36

Chapter 4 Jurisprudence of Rules and Exceptions 39
A. Res Judicata Rules and Exceptions 40
   B. Claim and Issue Preclusion Doctrine 43

Part II: Doctrine

Chapter 5 Prerequisites for Res Judicata 49
A. Validity 49
B. Finality 50
   1. Meanings of Finality 51
      a. Claim Preclusion 51
      b. Issue Preclusion 52
   2. Complications of Finality 55
      a. Effects of Reversal 55
      b. Inconsistent Judgments 55

Chapter 6 Claim Preclusion 61
A. Requirements of Rule 61
   1. Dimensions of Claim 62
      a. Evolution of Transactional View 62
      b. Application of Transactional View 69
   2. Extinguishing Claim by Judgment 82
      a. Merger 83
      b. Bar 85
B. Exceptions to Rule 85
   1. Adjudication Not on the Merits 85
      a. Dismissal for Lack of Jurisdiction 87
      b. Dismissal for Insufficiency of Complaint 87
CONTENTS

1. Judicial Dismissal
   a. Dismissal for Prematurity in Bringing Action 91
   d. Dismissal for Statute of Frauds 92
   e. Dismissal for Statute of Limitations 93
   f. Summary Judgment 96
   g. Voluntary Dismissal 96
   h. Involuntary Dismissal 97
   i. Dismissal for Insufficiency of Evidence 98
   j. Summary 98

2. Jurisdictional or Procedural Limitation 99

3. Judicial Permission 100

4. Party Agreement 102

5. Generalized Exception 103
   a. Conflict with Substantive Policy 103
   b. Misrepresentation by Defendant 104
   c. Other Extraordinary Situations 105

C. Special Applications: Counterclaims 106
   1. Interposition of Counterclaim 106
   2. Failure to Interpose Counterclaim 108
      a. Compulsory Counterclaim Statute or Rule 109
      b. Common-Law Compulsory Counterclaim 111

Chapter 7 Issue Preclusion 113

A. Requirements of Rule 113
   1. Same Issue 114
      a. Dimensions of Issue 114
      b. Applications 121
   2. Actually Litigated and Determined 123
      a. Applications 125
      b. A Contrary View 126
   3. Essential to the Judgment 127

B. Exceptions to Rule 129
   1. Certain Issues of Law 130
      a. Pure Questions of Law 130
      b. Inequitable Administration of Law 132
   2. Inferior Rendering Court 134
      a. Procedural Informality 134
      b. Jurisdictional Specialization 135
   3. Different Burden of Persuasion 138
   4. Inability to Appeal 138
   5. Unforeseeability 139
   6. Generalized Exception 141
      a. Lack of Full and Fair Opportunity 141
CONTENTS

1. Administrative Adjudications 208
2. Arbitration Awards 210

Chapter 10  Nondomestic Judgments 211
A. General Considerations 211
1. Recognition 212
2. Enforcement 212
B. Judgments of American Courts 213
1. State Judgments 213
   a. State—State 213
   b. State—Federal 221
2. Federal Judgments 223
   a. Federal—State 223
   b. Federal—Federal 226
C. Judgments of Foreign Nations 226
1. Rules for Recognition and Enforcement 226
   a. General Practices 226
   b. Preclusion Specifics 228
   c. Governing Law 229
2. Special Exceptions to Recognition and Enforcement 230
   a. Reciprocity 230
   b. Public Policy 231
3. Hague Treaty 232

Part III: Practice

Chapter 11  Invoking Res Judicata 237
A. Raising 237
1. Timing 238
2. Method 238
   a. Claim Preclusion 238
   b. Issue Preclusion 240
B. Proving 242
1. Burden 242
2. Evidence 243
3. Decision 244
4. Review 245

Chapter 12  Defeating Res Judicata 247
A. Methods of Attack 248
1. Motion for Relief 248
2. Independent Suit 248
3. Defensive Attack

B. Grounds for Attack
   1. Jurisdiction and Notice
      a. Jurisdiction
      b. Notice
      c. Summary
   2. Equitable Grounds
      a. General
      b. Fraud

C. Approaches to Attack’s Methods and Grounds
   1. Traditional, Rigid Approach
   2. Ultramodern, Fluid Approach
   3. Resolution

Chapter 13 Jurisdiction to Determine Jurisdiction

A. Status of This Subdoctrine
B. Content of This Subdoctrine
   1. Territorial Jurisdiction and Adequate Notice
   2. Subject-Matter Jurisdiction
C. Jurisdiction to Determine No Jurisdiction
D. A Final View of Validity and Finality

Table of Cases
Index
Res Judicata