Risk and Crisis Communication: Communicating Effectively in High Concern, High Stress, or Low Trust Situations

Dr. Vincent T. Covello
Director
Center for Risk Communication
New York, New York
Tel. (917) 270-5280
Email: vincentcovello@ix.netcom.com
vcovello@centerforriskcommunication.org
Exhibit 1: Hispanic Risk Communications Model

Risk Perception Model
- Trust
- Voluntariness
- Controllability
- Familiarity
- Fairness
- Benefits
- Catastrophic potential
- Understanding
- Uncertainty
- Delayed effects
- Effects on children
- Effects on future generations
- Victim identity
- Dread
- Media attention
- Accident history
- Reversibility
- Personal stake
- Ethical/moral nature
- Human vs. natural origin

Hispanic Cultural Values Model
- Familismo (Family Oriented)
- Personalismo (Interpersonal)
- Jerarquismo (Hierarchical)
- Presentismo (Present Oriented)
- Espiritismo (Spiritualism)
- Machismo/Marianismo (Traditional Gender Roles)

Hispanic Health Belief Model
- Perceived susceptibility
- Messages: Messenger; Means: (distribution channels)
- Perceived severity
- Messages: Messenger; Means: (distribution channels)
- Perceived benefits
- Messages: Messenger; Means: (distribution channels)
- Perceived barriers
- Messages: Messenger; Means: (distribution channels)
- Perceived cues to action
- Messages: Messenger; Means: (distribution channels)

Implications for Risk Communication

Copyright, Dr. V Covello, Center for Change/Risk Communication
Agenda

Part I: Core Concepts
Part 2: Templates
Part 3: Special Topics
Agenda

Part I: Core Concepts
Part 2: Templates
Part 3: Special Topics
Definition

Risk: “a threat of loss, real or perceived, to that which we value.”
Definition

Risk: “a threat of loss, real or perceived, to that which we value.”

Risk Communication: “the exchange of information about risks.”
Risk Communication: Subfields

• Health and Safety Risk Communication
• Environmental Risk Communication
• Organizational Change Risk Communication
• Organizational Conflict Risk Communication
• Crisis/Emergency Risk Communication
• Economic Risk Communication
• Marital/Relationship Risk Communication
Risk Communication:

Key Messages

• Risk communication is a science-based discipline

• High concern situations change the rules of communication

• The key to risk communication success is anticipation, preparation, and practice
Risk Communication: Key Messages

• Risk communication is a science-based discipline

• High concern situations change the rules of communication

• The key to risk communication success is anticipation, preparation, and practice
Risk Communication Literature

• Over 8000 Articles in Peer Reviewed Scientific Journals
• 2000 Books
Risk Communication Literature

www.riskcomm.org
Dr. R. Hyer and Dr. V. Covello


(www.amazon.com or www.who.int/bookorders)
“Communicating Radiation Risks”

- Sample scenarios
- Pre-approved messages
- Lessons learned
Risk and Crisis Communication Literature: Example

“Effective Risk and Crisis Communication During Water Security Emergencies”


(www.epa.gov/nhsr)
Risk Communication Literature: Example

Authors: Steven Hobfoll et. al.

Conclusion of Research
Provide people a sense of:

- Hope
- Self- and community efficacy
- Safety
- Calm
- Connectedness
Risk Communication Literature: Example

“The Magic Number Seven, Plus or Minus Two: Some Limits on Our Capacity for Processing Information”

George A. Miller (Department of Psychology, Princeton University)

The Psychological Review, 1956, vol. 63, pp. 81-97
Risk Communication Literature

• M. Gladwell, “Blink”
• J. Lehrer, “How We Decide”
• S. Bok, “Lying”
• R. Fisher, “Getting to Yes” (see also W. Ury, “Getting Past No: Negotiating with Difficult People”)
• P. Ekman, “Telling Lies: Clues to Deception” (see also P. Ekman, “Emotions Revealed”)
• D. Morris, “Body Talk: A Dictionary of Human Gestures”
• E. Tufte, “Visual Explanations”
Risk Communication: Key Messages

• Risk communication is a science-based discipline

• High concern situations change the rules of communication

• The key to risk communication success is anticipation, preparation, and practice
Risk Communication: Core Concepts

When people are stressed or concerned, they typically:

• ...have difficulty, hearing, understanding, and remembering information

• ...want to know that you care before they care what you know.

• ...focus most on what they hear first and last.

When people are stressed or concerned:

• ...they focus much more on negative information than positive information.

• ...they process information at well below their education level.

• ...they actively seek out additional sources of credible information.
Agenda

Part I: Core Concepts
Part 2: Templates
Part 3: Special Topics
Risk Communication
Templates (see handout)

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
- 1N=3P
- IDK
Risk Communication/Message Mapping Templates

• CCO
Caring/Empathy Principle

“When people are stressed and upset, they want to know that you care before they care what you know.”
The CCO Template

• Compassion
• Conviction
• Optimism
Trust Factors in High Stress Situations

- Listening/Caring/Empathy/Compassion: 50%
- Competence/Expertise: 15-20%
- Honesty/Openness: 15-20%
- All Other Factors: 15-20%

Assessed in first 9-30 seconds
CREDIBILITY LADDER

Most Credible

Professor (medical research)
Physician/Nurse
Pharmacist
...
...
...

Least Credible

Japan – Informal survey
I am going to read you a list of institutions in American society. Please tell me how much confidence you, yourself, have in each one — a great deal, quite a lot, some or very little?

July 8-11, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>% Great deal</th>
<th>% Quite a lot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The military</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small business</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The police</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The church or organized religion</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The medical system</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The presidency</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The U.S. Supreme Court</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The public schools</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The criminal justice system</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banks</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television news</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organized labor</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Maintenance Organizations (HMO)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Big business</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congress</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GALLUP
Templates

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
Mental Noise (Attention Span)

Mental noise can reduce the ability to process communication up to 80%.
templates

• Rule of 3
• 27/9/3
• Primacy/Recency
Mental Noise: The Rule of 3

Everything in Threes

– Three Key Messages
– Repeat Messages Three Times (e.g., Triple T Model)
– Key Messages Supported by Three Supporting Messages or Three Credible Sources
Templates

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
The 27/9/3 Template

• 27 words
• 9 seconds
• 3 messages
Message Map: What is meant by sheltering in place during a radiological emergency?

Key Message 1: Sheltering in place is a protective action which includes going indoors.

Key Message 2: People may be asked to shelter in place rather than evacuate.

Key Message 3: Staying indoors for a short time can protect people from exposure to radiation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder Question or Concern:</th>
<th>Key Message</th>
<th>Key Message</th>
<th>Key Message</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9 words on average</td>
<td>9 words on average</td>
<td>9 words on average</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 1.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 1.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 2.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 3.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 3.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Info. 3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Message</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Remove Standing Water</strong></td>
<td>Unattended swimming pools</td>
<td>Flower Pots/Bird Baths</td>
<td>Cup of Water</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Message</th>
<th>2.1</th>
<th>2.2</th>
<th>2.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wear Protective Clothing</strong></td>
<td>Long Sleeves</td>
<td>Long Pants</td>
<td>Dusk and Dawn</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Message</th>
<th>3.1</th>
<th>3.2</th>
<th>3.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use Insect Repellent</strong></td>
<td>DEET</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>Medical Research</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**West Nile Virus Map**

- 1.1: Unattended swimming pools
- 1.2: Flower Pots/Bird Baths
- 1.3: Cup of Water
- 2.1: Long Sleeves
- 2.2: Long Pants
- 2.3: Dusk and Dawn
- 3.1: DEET
- 3.2: 23%
- 3.3: Medical Research
How goes the war?

Key Message 1
I came

- SF1: The journey was long and hard
  - We traveled many days
  - Mountains were high
  - Valleys were deep

- SF2: We suffered heavy loses along the way
  - Many troops fell ill
  - Many were injured
  - Food and water grew scarce

- SF3: Despite the difficulties we arrived in force
  - We had the necessary legions
  - We had the necessary weapons
  - Morale was high

Key Message 2
I saw

- SF1: The enemy’s armies were large
  - There were more troops than reported
  - Their numbers stretched to the horizon
  - More were arriving every day

- SF2: They were well armed and equipped
  - They had the newest weapons
  - Every man was fully armed
  - They were re-supplied daily

- SF3: They were well positioned
  - They occupied the high ground
  - They were fully fortified
  - They deployed advance observers

Key Message 3
I conquered

- SF1: We engaged the enemy forthwith
  - We attacked at dawn
  - We had the element of surprise
  - We found them in disarray

- SF2: Our legions fought bravely
  - Our troops advanced steadily
  - They were fearless in battle
  - They were undaunted by greater numbers

- SF3: The enemy is destroyed
  - Their troops have deserted
  - They have abandoned their weapons
  - The victory is ours
Mayor Giuliani, 9/11

“The number of casualties is more than any of us can bear ultimately.”
Templates

• CCO
• Rule of 3
• 27/9/3
• Primacy/Recency
Primacy/Recency
Primacy/Recency

“When people are stressed and upset, they typically focus most on that which is said first (primacy) and last (recency).”
Primacy/Recency Template

• **Low Stress Situations:**
  Brain processes information based on
  *linear order* (e.g., 1, 2, 3)

• **High Stress Situations:**
  Brain processes information based on
  *primacy/recency* (e.g., 1, 3, 2)
Risk Communication Templates

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
- 1N=3P
- IDK
Risk Communication Templates

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
- 1N=3P
- IDK
1N=3P Template

=====

1N (Negative) Equals

3 P (Positives) Template

“When people are stressed and upset, they typically focus more on the negative than on the positive.”

(Negative Dominance Principle)
1N=3P
(Negative Dominance)

- Avoid absolutes
  - (e.g., never, always)
- Avoid Repeating Untrue
  Negatives/False Allegations
- Balance bad news with
  positive, constructive
  messages
General K. Kiley, MedCom Commander, Walter Reed Hospital: Congressional Testimony

Q.: “Do you hold yourself accountable for the squalid conditions provided for wounded soldiers at Walter Reed”
A.: “I’m trying not to say I’m not accountable.”

Q.: “How could you not have known?”
A.: “I don’t do barracks inspections at Walter Reed.”

Q. “Why did you do so little?”
A. “Walter Reed is not my only command.”

Source: March 6, 2007, Washington Post
Risk Communication Templates

- CCO
- Rule of 3
- 27/9/3
- Primacy/Recency
- 1N=3P
- IDK
I.D.K. (I Don’t Know) Template

- Repeat the question (optional)
- Say you don’t know/can’t answer/wish you could answer
- Give the reason you don’t know or can’t answer the question
- Indicate follow up
- Bridge to what you can say about the issue
Risk Communication:

Key Messages

- Risk communication is a science-based discipline
- High concern situations change the rules of communication
- The key to risk communication success is anticipation, preparation, and practice (APP)
APP Template

(A) Anticipate
(P) Prepare
(P) Practice
“If I had all day to cut a large tree, I would spend most of the day sharpening my axe.”
- Abraham Lincoln
Everybody is talking:
Risk Communication Goals

• enhance knowledge and understanding
• build trust and credibility
• encourage appropriate attitudes, behaviors and beliefs
Seven Step Risk Communication Strategy

1. Identify a risk communication issue or scenario
2. Identify the primary stakeholders/target audience
3. Identify potential questions or concerns
4. Develop key messages using message mapping
5. Develop supporting information for key messages
6. Test and practice messages
7. Deliver messages through appropriate communication channels
“95 percent of the concerns and questions of upset or concerned people in a crisis or an emergency can be predicted and prepared for in advance.”
“It takes me an average of two weeks to prepare an impromptu speech.”

Mark Twain
Stakeholder Predictability

“50 Most Frequently Asked Questions by Terminally Ill Patients”
Stakeholder Predictability

- “77 Most Frequently Asked Questions by Journalists in a Disaster” (handout)
Stakeholder Predictability

“65 Most Frequently Asked Questions about Pandemic Influenza”

(www.pandemicflu.gov)

“205 Most Frequently Asked Questions Following a Water Security or Water Contamination Event”

(USEPA, Effective Risk Communication during Water Security Emergencies”

EPA/600/R-07/027)
Risk Perception Theory

“Perception equals reality.”

“That which is perceived as real is real in its consequences.”
Risk Perceptions

• Facts alone are insufficient to address public fears and concerns.

• Less than 5% of public fears and concerns is driven by facts.

• More than 95% of public fears and concerns is driven by risk perception factors.
Risk Perception Theory

“When people are stressed and upset, the gap between perceptions and reality often becomes wider.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lower Concern/Fear</th>
<th>Higher Concern/Fear</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Trustworthy sources</td>
<td>Untrustworthy sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Large benefits</td>
<td>Few or unclear benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Under one’s control</td>
<td>Controlled by others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Voluntary</td>
<td>Involuntary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Fair</td>
<td>Unfair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Natural origin</td>
<td>Human origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Children not victims</td>
<td>Children as victims</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Risk Perception (Emotional/Fear) Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lower Concern/Fear</th>
<th>Higher Concern/Fear</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Trustworthy sources</td>
<td>Untrustworthy sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Large benefits</td>
<td>Few or unclear benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Under one’s control</td>
<td>Controlled by others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Risk Perception (Fear) Factors

- Trust
  - Listening/Caring
  - Competence/Expertise
  - Honesty/Transparency
- Benefits/Fairness
  - Societal
  - Community
  - Personal
- Control/Voluntariness
  - Choice
  - Voice
  - Knowledge
TBC Template
(Trust, Benefits, Control)

Key Message 1: Trust Message

Key Message 2: Benefits/Fairness Message

Key Message 3: Control Message
Risk Communication Vs “Spin”

Spin: “making things appear to that which they are not.”

Risk communication: “making things appear to that which they are.”
Risk Communication: Key Messages

• Risk communication is a science-based discipline

• High concern situations change the rules of communication

• The key to risk communication success is anticipation, preparation, and practice