Crime, Violence, and Development: Trends, Costs, and Policy Options in the Caribbean

March 2007

A Joint Report by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime and the Latin America and the Caribbean Region of the World Bank
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ADR Alternative Dispute Resolution
CEM Country Economic Memorandum
CFATF Caribbean Financial Action Task Force
CGNAA COSAT Guard for the Netherlands Antilles and Aruba
CONANI Consejo Nacional de la Niñez
CPI Corruption Perceptions Index
CPTED Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design
CTS Crime Trends Surveys – United Nations
DALYs Disability-Adjusted Life Years
DHS Department of Homeland Security
EBA Educación Básica para Adultos y Jóvenes
ECLAC Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
ENHOGAR Encuesta Nacional de Hogares de Propósitos Múltiples
EU/LAC European Union/Latin American and the Caribbean
FARC Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia
GDP Gross Domestic Product
ICS Investment Climate Survey
ICVS International Crime Victims Survey
LAC Latin America and Caribbean
OECS Organization of Eastern Caribbean States
PATH Program for Appropriate Technology in Health
RNN Royal Navy of the Netherlands
RSS Regional Security System
RTFCS Regional Task Force on Crime and Security
UNODC United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
WDR World Development Report
WHO World Health Organization

Vice President: Pamela Cox
Country Director: Caroline Anstey
PREM Director: Ernesto May
Sector Manager: Jaime Saavedra Chanduvi
Lead Economist: Antonella Bassani
Task Managers: Andrew R. Morrison
Bernice Van Bronkhorst
Gabriel Demombynes
Theodore Leggett (UNODC)
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface  

Acknowledgments  

Executive Summary  

Chapter 1. Conventional Crime: an Overview  
  The Diversity of the Caribbean  
  How to Measure Crime?  
  Homicide and Assault  
  Violence Against Women  
  Property Crime  

Chapter 2. Organized Crime  
  Drug Trafficking  
  Other Forms of Organized Crime: Kidnapping, Money Laundering, Corruption  

Chapter 3. Risk Factors for Crime and Violence  
  Conceptual Foundations of Risk Factors for Crime and Violence  
  Macro Analysis of Risk Factors for Crime in the World and the Caribbean  
  Risk Factors for Crime at the Household Level: Evidence from Three Caribbean Countries  
  Policy Implications  

Chapter 4. Socioeconomic Costs of Crime  
  Approaches to Measuring the Costs of Crime and Violence  
  Specific Costs of Crime  
  Total Costs: Estimates Using an Accounting Approach  
  Disability-Adjusted Life Years Lost to Violence  
  The Impact of Victimization on Self-Reported Life Satisfaction  
  The Impact of Violent Crime on Economic Growth  
  Policy Implications  

Chapter 5. Youth Violence in the Caribbean: A Case Study of the Dominican Republic  
  Scope of Youth Crime and Violence  
  Factors Contributing to Youth Violence  
  Policy Recommendations for Strengthening the Response to Youth Violence  
  Conclusions  

Chapter 6. Case Study: Criminal Deportations and Jamaica  
  The Scale of the Expatriate Population  
  Criminal Deportation  
  Policy Implications  

Chapter 7. Case Study: Drug Trafficking and the Netherlands Antilles  
  Drug Trafficking on Commercial Air Flights: an Innovative Policy Response  
  Maritime Trafficking  
  Policy Implications  
Chapter 8. The Contributions of Criminal Justice Systems to the Control of Crime and Violence: A Case Study of Jamaica and the Dominican Republic ___________ 105

Introduction: Criminal Justice Reform in Civil and Common Law System ___________ 105
Country Cases: Two Approaches to Criminal Justice Reform ___________ 108
A Quantitative Evaluation of System Performance: Performance Statistics and Indicators ___________ 112
Measuring the System’s Workload: Reported Offenses ___________ 113
Institutional Performance Measures ___________ 114
Impact Indicators: Using Crime and Arrest Data for Crime Prevention ___________ 122
Conclusion: From Organizational Reform and Performance Measurement to Interagency Governance ___________ 126

Chapter 9. Guns and Crime: A Case Study of Trinidad and Tobago ___________ 128
Sources ___________ 130
Registration of Firearms and Seizures of Illegal Weapons ___________ 131
Demand ___________ 132
Victims, Perpetrators and their Environment ___________ 132
Drug Trafficking and Gun-Related Criminality ___________ 133
Policy Implications ___________ 136

Chapter 10. Public Policy of Crime and Violence Prevention: Regional and National Approaches ___________ 141
Sectoral and Cross-Sectoral Approaches ___________ 141
Regional Initiatives to Address Crime and Violence ___________ 145
Priority Steps to Achieve Reductions in Crime and Violence in the Caribbean ___________ 149

References ___________ 141
Annexes ___________ 175

FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Ranking of Caribbean Countries in the Human Development Index ----------------------------- 3
Figure 1.2: Population Distribution of the Independent Caribbean ------------------------------------- 3
Figure 1.3: Murder Rates by Region --------------------------------------------------------------- 4
Figure 1.4: Murders per 100,000 Population by Year, Anguilla ---------------------------------------- 6
Figure 1.5: Number of Murders in Guyana, Police and Public Health Sources -------------------------- 7
Figure 1.6: Deaths Rates from Violence in Caribbean and Comparison Countries --------------------- 9
Figure 1.7: Homicides per 100,000 in Guyana and Jamaica ------------------------------------------- 10
Figure 1.8: Homicides Rates in the Dominican Republic, St. Lucia and Trinidad and Tobago: 1999-2005 11
Figure 1.9: Assault Rates in Caribbean and Comparison Countries ----------------------------------- 12
Figure 1.10: Rape Rates in Caribbean and Comparison Countries ------------------------------------- 12
Figure 2.1: Cannabis Eradication in Jamaica -------------------------------------------------------- 17
Figure 2.2: Shares of Cocaine Flowing to the United States by Transport Corridors ------------------ 17
Figure 2.3: Origin of Heroin Seized in the United States -------------------------------------------- 19
Figure 2.4: Kidnappings per 100,000 Population in Trinidad and Tobago ----------------------------- 23
Figure 3.1: Ecological Model for Understanding Crime and Violence ---------------------------------- 27
Figure 3.2: Cross-Country Correlates of Crime ------------------------------------------------------- 29
Figure 3.3: Robbery Rates vs. Mean Consumption by Neighborhood ----------------------------------- 36
Figure 3.4: Distribution of Victimization by Crime and Quintile in Haiti ---------------------------- 37
TABLES

Table 2.1: Highest Total Annual Cocaine Seizure, 1998-2004---------------------------------------------21
Table 3.1: Cross-Country Analysis - Basic Regression Results-------------------------------------------32
Table 3.2: Summary of Micro-Analysis of Risk Factors for Criminal Victimization------------------35
Table 4.1: Effects of Lifetime Physical Violence by Intimate Partner in Haiti--------------------------46
Table 4.2: The Costs of Crime in Jamaica: an Accounting Exercise-------------------------------------52
Table 4.3: Cross-Country Regression Estimate of the Effect of Violent Crime on Economic Growth----58
Table 5.1 Youth as Victims: Homicide Rates in Select Countries--------------------------------------64
Table 5.2: Highlights of Youth in Numbers in Latin America and the Caribbean--------------------------69
Table 5.3: Violence Prevention Strategies by Developmental Stage and Ecological Context--------------76
Table 8.1: Homicide Clearance Rates in Jamaica by “Murder Motive,” 2005 and 2006------------------115
Table 9.1: Murders Committed in Trinidad and Tobago Using a Firearm, 2001-2006----------------------129
Table 9.2: Woundings Committed in Trinidad and Tobago Utilizing a Firearm, 2000-2005-----------------130
Table 9.3: Firearm Seizures in Trinidad and Tobago-----------------------------------------------132
Table 9.4: Modified Haddon Matrix Applied to the Analysis of Gun-Related Criminality (GRC)---------135
Table 9.5. Possible Interventions Specific to Guns and Criminality-----------------------------------138
Table 10.1. Public Policy Approaches and Interventions to Address Urban Violence------------------144

ANNEXES

Annex 1.1. Caribbean Leaders on Crime---------------------------------------------------------------175
Annex 1.2. Tourism and the Caribbean Economy---------------------------------------------------------175
Annex 1.3. Emigration and Crime---------------------------------------------------------------------175
Annex 1.4. Caribbean Police Forces and Prison Populations---------------------------------------------176
Annex 2.1. The Jamaica Cannabis Trade---------------------------------------------------------------177
Annex 2.2. Patterns of Drug Transshipment by Organized Criminal Groups-----------------------------177
Annex 2.3. Dates of large Seizures of Cocaine Entering Canada from Caribbean Countries 2004------178
Annex 2.4. Organized Crime in Jamaica and the Dominican Republic----------------------------------178
Annex 2.5. Jamaat-al-Muslimeen in Trinidad and Tobago----------------------------------------------179
Annex 3.1. Caribbean Homicide Data Sources-----------------------------------------------------------179
Annex 4.1. Impact of Crime Victimization on Satisfaction with Life----------------------------------184
Annex 5.1. Risk Factors and Policy Responses to Youth Violence in the Dominican Republic-----------185
Annex 5.2. Inventory of Governmental Initiatives for Youth Violence Prevention in the Dominican Republic-----------------------------188
Annex 5.3. Inventory of Civil Society Initiatives for Youth Violence Prevention in the Dominican Republic---------------193
Annex 6.1. Criminal Deportations to Jamaica by Year, Offence, and Sending Country------------------199
PREFACE

This report is the result of a fruitful collaboration between the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the World Bank. It addresses the issue of crime and violence in the Caribbean, a complex problem that prejudices both the social and economic development of the region.

The Governments of the Caribbean countries recognize the seriousness of the problem and are exploring innovative policy responses at both the national and regional levels. Civil society organizations are doing their part as well by designing and implementing violence prevention programs targeting youth violence, violence against women, and other important forms of violence.

Much, however, remains to be done. Some of the factors that make the Caribbean most vulnerable to crime and violence—the drug trade and trafficking of weapons are two important examples—require a response that transcends national and even regional boundaries. Also, promising initiatives at the national level must be evaluated for effectiveness so that scarce resources can be efficiently invested.

This report is offered as a contribution to the ongoing dialogue in the region on approaches to address crime and violence. It is not intended to provide a definitive blueprint for action, but rather is offered as a tool to engage stakeholders—governments, civil society organizations, citizens, and international partners—in a serious dialogue on crime and violence, based on evidence and good practices from inside and outside the region.

Francis Maertens
Director, Division for Policy Analysis and Public Affairs
UNODC

Caroline Anstey
Country Director for the Caribbean
World Bank
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report is a joint product of the United National Office of Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the World Bank. The multisectoral team was led by Theodore Leggett (UNODC), Bernice van Bronkhorst (LCSFU), Gabriel Demombynes (LCSPP), and Andrew Morrison (PRMGE). Individual chapters were prepared by Mr. Leggett (overview chapters, criminal deportees in Jamaica, narcotics trafficking in the Netherlands Antilles), Mr. Demombynes (risk factors and costs), Linda McGinnis and Peter Holland (HDNCY: youth in the Dominican Republic), and Ms. van Bronkhorst and Mr. Morrison (public policy). The criminal justice chapter was written by Linn Hammergren (LCSPS) and Stephanie Ann Kuttner (SDV), based on a background paper on criminal justice prepared by Todd Fogleson (Vera Institute of Justice) and Christopher Stone (Harvard University). The firearms chapter was written by Bernice van Bronkhorst, Andrew Morrison, and Theodore Leggett, based on a background paper prepared by Yvette Holder (independent consultant) and Folade Mutota (Women’s Institute for Alternative Development, Trinidad and Tobago). The team benefited from significant contributions from Ana Maria Diaz (LCSPP) and Mariel Fiat (LCCDO), as well as the excellent assistance of Ane Perez Orsi de Castro (LCSPP) in the preparation of the final report. The team would also like to thank the following individuals for their contributions: Lisa Bhansali, Teresa Genta-Fons, Lillian Mallet Crawford Abbensetts, Willy Egset, Dorte Verner, and Christina Malmberg Calvo.

The team is very grateful for the work and insightful comments of its External Advisory Committee, chaired by Professor Anthony Harriott (Professor, University of the West Indies-Mona, Jamaica) and comprised of Dr. Franklin Almeyda (Minister of the Interior and Police, Dominican Republic), Mr. George de Peana (General Secretary, Caribbean Congress of Labor, Barbados), Professor Ramesh Deosaran (Director, Center for Criminology and Criminal Justice, University of the West Indies-St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago), Dr. Len Ishmael (Director General, OECS Secretariat, St. Lucia), Colonel Trevor MacMillan (Chairman, Standing Committee on National Security of the Private Sector Organization of Jamaica), the Honorable Dale D. Marshall (Attorney General, Barbados), and the Honorable Gail Teixeira (Special Advisor to the President and Director, Governance Unit, Office of the Presidency, Guyana).

This task was guided and supervised by Jaime Saavedra (Sector Manager, LCSPR) and Antonella Bassani (Lead Economist, LCSPR). The peer reviewers were Pablo Fajnzylber (LCSFR), Wendy Cunningham (LCSHS), and Anthony Harriott (University of the West Indies, Mona Campus).